



STATE OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

BARBARA D. UNDERWOOD
ACTING ATTORNEY GENERAL

DIVISION OF STATE COUNSEL
LITIGATION BUREAU

Writer Direct: (518) 776-2626

May 14, 2018

Honorable Brenda K. Sannes
United States District Court Judge
Federal Building and U.S. Courthouse
P.O. Box 7336
Syracuse, NY 13261-7396

Re: *New York State Rifle & Pistol Association v. Beach*
Northern District of New York
18-CV-0134 (BKS)(ATB)

Dear Judge Sannes:

Defendants decline to submit a reply Memorandum of Law. I respectfully point out to the Court that plaintiffs acknowledge that this Court is bound by the Second Circuit's decision in *Kachalsky v. County of Westchester*, 701 F.3d 81 (2d Cir. 2012). *See, e.g.*, Dkt. #1, ¶6; Dkt. #26, Plaintiffs Memorandum in Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Dismiss, pp. 1, 5, 24-25. For that reason, those stated in defendants' opening Memorandum of Law and those set forth in the Memorandum of Everytown for Gun Safety as Amicus Curiae in Support of Defendants (Dkt. #25), defendants' motion to dismiss should be granted.

The Court's attention to this matter is appreciated.

Respectfully,

s/ Kelly L. Munkwitz

Kelly L. Munkwitz
Assistant Attorney General
Bar Roll No. 509910
Kelly.Munkwitz@ag.ny.gov

c: Kathleen McCaffrey Baynes, Esq. (via ECF)
KATHLEEN MCCAFFREY BAYNES, ESQ., PLLC
21 Everett Road Extension, Suite A-4
Albany, NY 12205

David H. Thompson, Esq.
COOPER & KIRK, PLLC (via email)
1523 New Hampshire Avenue, N.W.
Washington, DC 20036